

NEW YORK STATE DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL CONSERVATION

Office of General Counsel, Region 4
1130 North Westcott Road, Schenectady, NY 12306-2014
P: (518) 357-2048 | F: (518) 357-2087
www.dec.ny.gov

CERTIFIED - RETURN RECEIPT REQUESTED
7017 1070 0001 0125 8862

August 21, 2018

Rhonda Minshall
HVOCP, LLC
7 Leslie Circle
East Greenbush, New York 12061

Re: Order on Consent
R4-2018-0725-164

Dear Ms. Minshall:

Enclosed please find a copy of the fully executed Order on Consent referenced above.

This will also acknowledge receipt of \$1,500 the civil penalty pursuant to Paragraph I.

Sincerely,

Stephen Repsher / jv

Stephen Repsher
Assistant Regional Attorney
Region 4

Enclosure

ec: S. Whelen

STATE OF NEW YORK: DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL CONSERVATION

In the Matter of Violations of the
Environmental Conservation Law (“ECL”)
Article 33, and Title 6 of the Official
Compilation of Codes, Rules and
Regulations of the State of
New York (“6 NYCRR”),

-by-

ORDER ON CONSENT
R4-2018-0725-164

HVOCP, LLC
7 Leslie Circle
East Greenbush, NY 12061,

Respondent.

WHEREAS:

Jurisdiction

1. The New York State Department of Environmental Conservation (Department) is the State agency with jurisdiction over the environmental law and policy of the State pursuant to §33-0301 of the Environmental Conservation Law (“ECL”), among other authorities. The Department is and has been responsible for the regulation of the use, and for the enforcement of the provisions of law governing the use of pesticides in the State pursuant to ECL Article 33 and the rules and regulations promulgated thereunder at Title 6 of the Official Compilation of Codes, Rules and Regulations of the State of New York (6 NYCRR) Part 325.
2. Respondent, HVOCP LLC, d/b/a Hudson Valley Organic Pest Control, is a domestic limited liability company engaged in the commercial pest control business in the State of New York.
3. Respondent is a person as defined in ECL § 33-0101(33).

VIOLATIONS

4. On June 27, 2018, Department staff conducted a routine compliance inspection of Respondent’s facility and records.
5. During the June 27, 2018 inspection, Department staff observed a sample of Respondent’s pesticide use records and discovered that the records failed to include the EPA registration numbers and dosage rates for each pesticide application.

6. ECL § 33-1205(1) requires that all commercial pesticide applicators shall maintain pesticide use records for each pesticide application containing the following:
 - a. EPA registration number;
 - b. product name;
 - c. quantity of each pesticide used;
 - d. date applied;
 - e. location of application by address (including five-digit zip code).
7. Respondent's failure to record the EPA registration numbers and dosage rates for each pesticide application in its pesticide use records is a violation of ECL § 33-1205(1).
8. During the June 27, 2018 inspection, Department staff discovered that Respondent had failed to enter into written contracts with the owners of the properties to which commercial lawn applications were made.
9. Regulations at 6 NYCRR § 325.40(a) provide, in relevant part, that "[p]rior to a commercial lawn application . . . the pesticide applicator or business providing these services must enter into a written contract with the owner of the property to which the commercial lawn application is to be made or the owner's agent."
10. Respondent's failure to enter into a written contract with the owner, or owner's agent, of the property to which a commercial lawn application was made is a violation of 6 NYCRR § 325.40(a).
11. Department staff acknowledge that Respondent has drafted a compliant written commercial lawn application contract since the June 27, 2018 inspection took place.

Civil Penalty

12. ECL § 71-2907 (1) provides, *inter alia*, that "any person who violates any provisions of article 33 of this chapter or any rule, regulation or order issued thereunder . . . shall be liable . . . for a civil penalty not to exceed five thousand dollars for a first violation, and not to exceed ten thousand dollars for a subsequent offense."

Waiver of Hearing

13. Respondent has affirmatively waived its right to notice and hearing in the manner provided by law and has consented to the issuing and entering of this Order and agrees to be bound by its terms, provisions and conditions contained within the Order.

NOW, having considered this matter and being duly advised, **IT IS ORDERED THAT:**

I. **Civil Penalty.** Respondent is assessed a civil penalty in the amount ONE THOUSAND FIVE HUNDRED DOLLARS (\$1,500). Payment of the civil penalty is due upon the return of a signed and notarized copy of this Order to the Department. The civil penalty shall be paid by money order, company or bank check made payable to the NYS Department of Environmental Conservation. Payment of the civil penalty shall not alter Respondent's obligation to complete performance of the terms of this Order.

II. **Binding Effect.** The provisions of this Order shall be deemed to bind Respondent, its agents, employees, and all persons, firms, corporations acting under or controlled by it.

III. **Communications.** Except as otherwise specified in this Order, any reports, submissions, and notices herein required shall be made to:

For the Department:

NYS Department of Environmental Conservation
Region 4
Bureau of Pesticides
Attn: Sarah Whelen
1130 North Westcott Road
Schenectady, NY 12306

For the Respondent:

HVOCP, LLC
Attn: Rhonda Minshall
7 Leslie Circle
East Greenbush, NY 12061

IV. **Summary Abatement.** The terms of this Order shall not be construed to prohibit the Commissioner or his duly authorized representative from exercising any summary abatement powers, either at common law or as granted pursuant to statute or regulation.

V. **Indemnification.** Respondent shall indemnify and hold harmless the Department, the State of New York, and their representatives and employees for all claims, suits, actions, damages and costs of every name and description arising out of or resulting from the fulfillment or attempted fulfillment of the provisions hereof by Respondent, its directors, officers, employees, servants, agents, successors or assigns, except to the extent that any such claims arise or result from the acts or omissions by the Department, the State of New York, or its employees.

VI. **Modification.** No change in this Order shall be made or become effective except as set forth by a written order of the Commissioner or the Commissioner's designee, such change to be made only upon written agreement of the parties.

VII. **Effective Date.** This Order is deemed effective on the date signed by the Department. The Department will provide Respondent a fully executed copy of this Order as soon as practicable following the effective date of this Order.

VIII. **Scope.** Except as specifically provided in this Order, nothing contained in this Order shall be construed as barring, diminishing, adjudicating or in any way affecting:

A. Any legal or equitable rights or claims, actions, proceedings, suits, causes of action or demands whatsoever that the Department or State may have against Respondent for any other violations of the ECL, rules or regulations promulgated thereunder;

B. Any legal or equitable rights or claims, actions, proceedings, suits, causes of action or demands whatsoever that the State may have against anyone other than Respondent, its agents, its servants, its employees, its successors and its assigns; and

C. Respondent's right to assert all available defenses to any claims, actions, proceedings, suits, causes of actions or demands made or commenced by the State or the Department provided, however, that Respondent waives all legal or equitable rights claims, actions, proceedings, appeals, suits, causes of action, defenses or demands whatsoever that it may have to a judicial review of the validity and binding effect of this Order and whether or not this Order has been entered into voluntarily by Respondent.

IX. **Review of Submitted Documentation.**

1. All documents which Respondent must submit pursuant to this Order are subject to Department approval.

2. The Department shall review each submittal from Respondent pursuant to this Order to determine whether it was prepared, and whether the work performed to generate the data in the submittal was prepared, in accordance with this Order and with generally accepted technical and scientific principles. The Department shall notify Respondent in writing of its approval or disapproval of the submittal. All Department-approved submittals shall be incorporated into and become an enforceable part of this Order; and Respondent shall implement them in accordance with their respective schedules and terms, as approved.

3(a). If the Department disapproves a submittal, it shall notify Respondent in writing and shall specify the reasons for disapproval. Within the time frame set forth in that written notification, Respondent shall make a revised submittal to the Department that addresses and resolves all the stated reasons for disapproval of the initial submittal.

3(b). After receipt of a revised submittal, the Department shall notify Respondent in writing of its approval or disapproval. If the revised submittal is not approvable as submitted, the Department, at its option, may disapprove it or may approve it on condition that Respondent accept such modifications as may be specified by the Department to make it approvable. If Respondent does not accept such modifications, the revised submittal will be disapproved. If the Department disapproves the revised submittal, Respondent shall be in violation of this Order. If the Department approves the revised submittal, it shall be incorporated into and become an enforceable part of this Order.

4. Respondent shall modify and/or amplify and expand a submittal upon the Department's direction to do so if the Department determines, as a result of reviewing data generated by an activity required under this Order, or as a result of reviewing any other data or facts, that further work is necessary. The Department agrees that any modifications it specifies shall be reasonable and consistent with customary engineering standards.

X. **Access.** To ensure compliance with the ECL and this Order, Respondent shall not deny the Commissioner or his duly authorized representative access at all reasonable times to inspect Respondent's New York facilities and all pesticide records for applications within the State of New York.

XI. **Schedule of Compliance.** Respondent shall comply with the attached Schedule of Compliance.

XII. **Termination.** This Order shall terminate upon the Department's determination that Respondent has complied with all the requirements of this Order.

DATED: August 20, 2018
Rotterdam, New York

Basil Seggos
Commissioner
New York State Department of
Environmental Conservation

BY:



Keith Goertz
Regional Director
Region 4

CONSENT BY RESPONDENT

Respondent, HVOCP LLC, hereby consents to the issuing and entering of this Order, waives its rights to notice and hearing herein and agrees to be bound by the provisions, terms and conditions contained herein.

SIGNED: Rhonda Minshall

PRINTED: Rhonda Minshall

TITLE: Managing Member

DATE: 8-16-18

STATE OF NEW YORK)
COUNTY OF Albany) ss.:

On the 16 day of August in the year 2018, before me, the undersigned,

personally appeared Rhonda Marie Minshall, personally known
(Full name)

to me or proved to me on the basis of satisfactory evidence to be the individual whose name is subscribed to the within instrument and acknowledged to me that s/he executed the same in his/her capacity, and that by his/her signature on said instrument, the individual, or the person upon behalf of which the individual acted, executed the instrument.

[Signature]

Notary Public
Qualified in the County of: Albany
My Commission Expires: 06/22/19

MICHAEL CREMEN
Notary Public - State of New York
No. 01CR6324634
Qualified in Albany
My Commission Exp. 06/22/2019



SCHEDULE OF COMPLIANCE

- (1) **Within thirty (30) days of the effective date of this Order**, Respondent shall submit to the Department a signed and notarized Compliance Verification Affidavit ("CVA," enclosed) certifying that the actions necessary to comply with the Department's regulatory program, and those actions specified in this document, have been completed, along with any supporting documentation.
- (2) Compliance with this Schedule shall not be a defense to subsequent violations.

The signed and notarized CVA should be addressed to:

Sarah Whelen
NYS Department of Environmental Conservation
Region 4
Bureau of Pest Management
1130 North Westcott Road
Schenectady, NY 12306

STATE OF NEW YORK: DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL CONSERVATION

In the Matter of Violations of the
Environmental Conservation Law ("ECL")
Article 33, and Title 6 of the Official
Compilation of Codes, Rules and
Regulations of the State of
New York ("6 NYCRR"),

AFFIDAVIT

-by-

HVOCP, LLC
7 Leslie Circle
East Greenbush, NY 12061,

Respondent.

I, Rhonda Minshall, being duly sworn, do depose and say
(Full Name)
that HVOCP LLC has complied with the requirements of Paragraph No. 1 of the Order on
Consent's Schedule of Compliance (File# R4-2018-0725-164) effective on the date
signed by the Regional Director.

Rhonda Minshall
Signature of Respondent

Subscribed and sworn to before me
on this 16 day of August, 2018

[Signature]
Notary Public

MICHAEL CREMEN
Notary Public - State of New York
No. 01CR6324634
Qualified in Albany
My Commission Exp. 06/22/2019

