

NEW YORK STATE DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL CONSERVATION

Office of General Counsel, Region 4
1130 North Westcott Road, Schenectady, NY 12306-2014
P: (518) 357-2048 | F: (518) 357-2087
www.dec.ny.gov

CERTIFIED - RETURN RECEIPT REQUESTED
7016 0340 0000 4616 6352

January 30, 2018

Joe Singh
Apple Food Store
340 Main St.
P.O. Box 917
Middleburgh, NY 12122

Re: Order on Consent
R4-2017-0821-236
PBS # 4-484385
Apple Food Store

Dear Mr. Singh:

Enclosed please find a copy of the fully executed Order on Consent referenced above.

This will also acknowledge receipt of \$5,000 the civil penalty pursuant to Paragraph I.

Sincerely,



Karen S. Lavery
Assistant Regional Attorney
Region 4

Enclosure

ec: T. Lane



Department of
Environmental
Conservation

STATE OF NEW YORK
DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL CONSERVATION

In the Matter of Violations of Article 17 of New
York State Environmental Conservation Law

ORDER ON CONSENT

-by-

R4-2017-0821-236
PBS # 4-484385

Harjit Kaur
3109 Belmont Avenue
Vestal, NY 13850

Respondent

WHEREAS:

JURISDICTION

1. The Department of Environmental Conservation (“Department”) is an agency of the State charged with jurisdiction over the protection of water quality of the State pursuant to Article 17 of the ECL and the rules and regulations promulgated thereto.
2. Respondent, Harjit Kaur, owns and/or operates a Petroleum Bulk Storage (“PBS”) facility (4-484385) known as Apple Food Store, located at Rt 145 & Rt 30, Middleburg, NY 12122 (Schoharie County) (“facility”).
3. On May 17, 2017, Department staff inspected the facility and observed the following violations:

| | |
|----------------------------|--|
| 613-1.9(a) | Registration information not current and valid (emergency phone number inaccurate but corrected) |
| 613-1.9(g) | Failure to display certificate |
| 613-2.1(b)(4)(iii)(a) | No as-built plans or Improper as-built plans |
| 613-2.2(a)(6) | Failure to maintain fill ports |
| 613-2.3(d)(1) | Automatic line leak detector not tested |
| 613-2.3(e)(1); ECL 17-1005 | No inventory records |
| 613-2.4(d)(1) | Failure to report a spill - non-contained spill |
| 613-2.4(d)(1) | Failure to report a spill - dispenser sump |
| 613-2.4(d)(1) | Failure to report a spill - tank top sump |
| 613-2.4(d)(1) | Failure to report a spill - spill bucket |
| 613-2.5 | Operating without a designated and trained Class C Operator |
| Former 613.9(b)(2)(i) | Tanks not properly closed permanently (Liquid and Sludge removed from tanks in 2014 are still in drums onsite) |

4. ECL Section 71-1929 provides for a civil penalty of up to \$37,500 per day for a violation of any provision of Titles 1 thru 11 inclusive and title 19 of Article 17, or the rules, regulations, orders or determinations of the Commissioner promulgated thereto. Injunctive relief is also available.
5. Respondent has affirmatively waived his right to notice and hearing in the manner provided by law, and has consented to the issuing and entering of this Order and it agrees to be bound by the terms, provisions and conditions contained herein.

REMEDIES

NOW, having considered this matter and being duly advised, it is ORDERED that:

I. Penalty

With respect to the violations identified in this Order, Respondent is hereby assessed a civil penalty of FIVE THOUSAND DOLLARS (\$5,000) which shall be payable to the New York State Department of Environmental Conservation by money order, or certified check at the time this Order is signed, notarized and returned to the Department.

II. Force Majeure

Respondent shall not be in default of compliance with this Order if it is unable to comply with any provision of this Order solely because of an action of a national government or court, or an act of nature, war, strike, riot or catastrophe, as to any of which the negligence or willful misconduct of Respondent was not a proximate cause. Respondent shall notify DEC in writing immediately upon obtaining knowledge of any such event. Relief under this clause shall not be available if Respondent fails to timely comply with the notice requirement set out in this paragraph.

III. Communications

All communications required herein shall be made to: Department -- DEC Region 4, 1130 North Westcott Road, Schenectady, NY 12306, Attn: Regional Spill Engineer. All submittals shall have the following information: owner's name, facility name and address, and the PBS Identification number.

IV. Access

Respondent shall allow duly authorized representatives of DEC access to the facility referred to in this Order without prior notice, at such times as may be desirable or necessary in order for DEC to inspect and determine the status of Respondent's compliance with this Order or the ECL.

V. Summary Abatement

This Order shall not be construed to prohibit the Commissioner or his duly authorized representative from exercising any summary abatement powers, either at common law or as granted pursuant to statute or regulation.

VI. Indemnification

Respondent shall indemnify and hold DEC, New York State, and their representatives and employees harmless for all claims, suits, damages, and costs of every name and description arising out of or resulting from the fulfillment or attempted fulfillment of the provisions hereof by Respondent, his directors, officers, employees, servants, agents, successors or assigns.

VII. Review of Submittals

1. All documents which Respondent must submit pursuant to this Order are subject to Department approval.

2. The Department shall review each of the submittals Respondent makes pursuant to this Order to determine whether it was prepared, and whether the work done to generate the data and other information in the submittal was done, in accordance with this Order and generally accepted technical and scientific principles. The Department shall notify Respondent in writing of its approval or disapproval of the submittal. All Department-approved submittals shall be incorporated into and become an enforceable part of this Order; and Respondent shall implement them in accordance with their respective schedules and terms, as approved.

3.a. If the Department disapproves a submittal, it shall so notify Respondent in writing and shall specify the reasons for its disapproval. Within the time frame set forth in that written notification, Respondent shall make a revised submittal to the Department that addresses and resolves all of the Department's stated reasons for disapproving the first submittal.

b. After receipt of the revised submittal, the Department shall notify Respondent in writing of its approval or disapproval. If the revised submission is not approvable as submitted, the Department, at its option, may disapprove it or may approve it on condition that Respondent accepts such modifications as may be specified by Department to make it approvable. If Respondent does not accept such modifications, the revised submission will be disapproved. If the Department disapproves the revised submittal, Respondent shall be in violation of this Order. If the Department approves the revised submittal, it shall be incorporated into and become an enforceable part of this Order.

4. Respondent shall modify and/or amplify and expand a submittal upon the Department's direction to do so if the Department determines, as a result of reviewing data generated by an activity required under this Order or as a result of reviewing any other data or facts, that further work is necessary. The Department agrees that any modifications it specifies will be reasonable and consistent with customary engineering standards.

VIII. Binding Effect

The provisions of this Order shall inure to the benefit of and be binding upon the Department and Respondent and his successors (including successors in title) and assigns.

IX. Modification

No change in this Order shall be made or become effective except as set forth by a written order of the Commissioner or the Commissioner's designee.

X. Entire Order

The provisions of this Order constitute the complete and entire Order issued to the Respondent concerning resolution of the violations identified herein. No term, condition, understanding or agreement purporting to modify or vary any term hereof shall be binding unless made in writing and subscribed by the party to be bound, pursuant to Paragraph IX of this Order. No informal oral or written advice, guidance, suggestion or comment by the Department regarding any report, proposal, plan, specification, schedule, comment or statement made or submitted by Respondent shall be construed as relieving Respondent of his obligations to obtain such formal approvals as may be required by this Order.

XI. Effective Date

The effective date of this Order shall be the date it is signed by the Regional Director.

XII. Reservation of Rights

Except as specifically provided in this Order, nothing contained in this Order shall be construed as barring, diminishing, adjudicating or in any way affecting:

A. Any legal or equitable rights or claims, actions, proceedings, suits, causes of action or demands whatsoever that the State may have against Respondent for any other violations of the ECL, rules or regulations promulgated thereunder.

B. Any legal or equitable rights or claims, actions, proceedings, suits, causes of action or demands whatsoever that the State may have against anyone other than Respondent, his officers, directors, agents, servants, employees, successors and assigns;

C. Whatever right the Department has to bring any action or proceeding against Respondent and/or any of Respondent's directors, officers, employees, servants, agents, successors, and assigns with respect to claims for natural resource damages; and

D. Respondent's right to assert all available defenses to any claims, actions, proceedings, suits, causes of actions or demands made or commenced by the State or the Department provided, however, that Respondent waives all legal or equitable rights claims, actions, proceedings, appeals, suits, causes of action, defenses or demands whatsoever that it may have to a judicial review of the validity and binding effect of this Order and whether or not this Order has been entered into voluntarily by Respondent.

XIII. Multiple Respondents

If more than one Respondent is a signatory to this Order, use of the term "Respondent" in this Order shall be deemed to refer to each Respondent identified in the Order.

DATED: *January 30*, 2018
Rotterdam, New York

Basil Seggos
Commissioner
New York State Department of
Environmental Conservation

BY:



Keith Goertz
Regional Director
Region 4

