



Department of
Environmental
Conservation



NYC Industrial Waterfront Communities Pollution Prevention, Toxics Reduction, and Resiliency Planning

Meeting Minutes from Second Stakeholder Engagement Group **Meeting Agenda**

Date: Friday, December 5th
Time: 1:00-2:30pm
Location: THE POINT CDC, 940 Garrison Avenue, Bronx, NY 10474
Facilitators: NYC-EJA and Kellie Terry, THE POINT CDC

Meeting minutes from the second stakeholder engagement group meeting concerning **NYC Industrial Waterfront Pollution Prevention, Toxics Reduction, and Resiliency Planning**. The meeting was held at THE POINT CDC on Friday December 5th, 2014 with participants from the New York State Department of Environmental Conservation (NYS-DEC), the New York State Pollution Prevention Institute (NYS-P2I), the New York City Environmental Justice Alliance (NYC-EJA), and members of the Stakeholder Engagement Group.

Attendees:

Ramon Cabral, Congressman Jose Serrano
Alexa Campos, Community Board 2 Environmental Committee
Steve Dorn, Milea Trucks
Tom Outerbridge, SIMS
Kellie Terry, THE POINT CDC
Angela Tovar, Sustainable South Bronx

Leonel Batista, NYS-DEC
Paul John NYS-DEC
Rodney Rivera, NYS-DEC
Venetia Lannon, NYS-DEC
Natasha Dwyer, NYC-EJA
Juan Camilo Osorio, NYC-EJA
Eddie Bautista, NYC-EJA
Rajiv Ramchandra, NYS-P2I
Judy-Ann Mitchell, US-EPA
Lorne LaMonica, US-EPA
Georges Ekwensi, NYC-EJA Fellow

Welcoming remarks

Kellie Terry, Executive Director of THE POINT CDC.

1. Introduction

Venetia Lannon, NYS-DEC -- this project is addressing the potential threat that industrial businesses pose to neighbors in the event of flooding and storm surge. The South Bronx Significant Maritime and Industrial Area is one of six SMIA's located in environmental justice communities, where NYC-EJA has raised concerns given the concentration of toxics, existing community vulnerabilities, and potential flooding and storm surge. What are the learning opportunities? There is an absence of data. What chemicals are businesses using? Where are opportunities to reduce toxics exposures and prevent worst case scenario. How can we make businesses stronger and lessen cost to their neighbors?

Judy-Ann Mitchell, EPA -- EPA is working closely to other grantees in New Jersey. We are excited to hear about work being done in the South Bronx.

Eddie Bautista, NYC-EJA -- What we need is a strong partnership with government. For this to work, the process cannot just be advocacy or regulatory driven. Businesses do not know what climate change means for them. The process began in 2010, when reviewing coastal zone management reform we used new GIS tools, in the context of climate change impacts. Where we realize that we need to figure out a way to partner. We have also established partnerships with UPROSE, the Rand Corporation and The Lifeline Group in the Sunset Park SMIA to address similar concerns. We are anxious to see what we can do with all our information regarding best practices. We are finding out just how cutting edge this stuff is, NYC-EJA has taken part in international discussions about waterfront practices for EJ and climate justice communities worldwide. Who knows how far these lessons can be shared.

Rajiv Ramchandra, NYS-P2I -- We are located up in Rochester, NY. The Stakeholder Engagement Group in particular is critical to how this project has been received and perceived. Had this not happened, this would have fallen flat on its face.

Juan Camilo Osorio, NYC-EJA -- NYC-EJA member organizations in South Bronx, thank you.

Kellie Terry, THE POINT -- The purpose of the meeting would be to think about how we are going to be moving forward -- come up with a work plan and discuss community outreach techniques to increase stakeholders engagement.

2. Project Overview and status update

Overview

Paul John, NYS-DEC – see slide handout for more information.

Overview goals and objective: We focused on the zip codes on the map where the area of study went beyond the SMIA. The focus of the study has been the areas that were impacted. Before working at DEC I worked at NYC Department of Environmental Protection (NYC-DEP) and the South Bronx was a particularly problematic area then. Now we see important improvements.

Tasks Summary: A key part is to get the data where chemicals are stored, where are they putting the stuff? There are 60 facilities in the South Bronx area targeted for assessment. We are using an assessment form produced by the project, where there are different environmental categories to check, hazardous waste etc. We have used Reference USA along with federal/state/local facility data to document the location of businesses. Half the battle is figuring out who's there? The businesses change so frequently. Every three years factories changed (e.g. manufacturing moves to China).

Types of Facilities Assessed:

- Auto
- Architectural
- Food
- Manufacturing
 - (52 completed/in progress) [Draft map of 52 locations displayed]

Dry cleaners assessed have expressed interest in replacing PERC. We are still deciding which two companies to focus on.

Juan Camilo Osorio, NYC-EJA -- Hunt's Point is full of small facilities that are regulated differently, hence the need to combine existing datasets with qualitative observations that document their nature and conditions.

Eddie Bautista, NYC-EJA -- It would be important for one of the businesses chosen to be auto-related because there is going to be an important relocation of these types of business to Hunts Point from Willets Point, Queens. How many businesses are being relocated?

Kellie Terry, THE POINT -- Something around 60+ businesses. There are certain environmental standards discussed, but this discussion is still in progress through the Community Board – which has expressed interest on how this research is going to set precedents for businesses entering community.

Eddie Bautista, NYC-EJA -- There may be an opportunity here to be able to inform the doubling or tripling growth of this sector in the area -- and intervene beforehand, but there has not been the opportunity yet. No one planned for this but there will be all sorts of benefits coming out of this research.

Paul John, NYS-DEC -- Yes, based on our knowledge there can be.

Rajiv Ramchandra, NYS-P2I -- At this point, we are looking for convergence of factors. We can say “we want to pick these two” but they ultimately have to agree. Factors include data analysis, timing, confines, willingness of company, etc.

Report on Status

Leonel Batista, NYS-DEC -- Explains pictures of auto related business. We have found a number of different problems. People try to label tanks and register everything, etc. We tell people if they are not doing something right and correct their practices. Pointing out techniques for improvement and providing information during site visits. We inform about what the project is about within the context of climate change. Majority of business are owned by Spanish speakers.

Eddie Bautista, NYC-EJA -- Facility assessments are all within storm surge (flood plain) zones; 100 yr. and 500 yr. flood plains?

Paul John, NYS-DEC -- No, there is a mix. A drycleaner serves the hotels industry. They expressed interest in the study. They are at 132nd street, within one block of the water, and want to make full transformation. Receptive to resilience ideas.

Question from audience -- is there a deadline for selection of companies? Answer — yes.

Overview of electroplater industry. Industry is quite heavily regulated (also jaded and difficult to work with). Facilities can be beautiful, well run and well managed. Others do just enough to stay compliant. In terms of looking at it from a sustainability and triple bottom-line, there are opportunities to improve. You can tell within seconds the condition of ventilation and other things. Immediate impact for people who work and live around these facilities (some of whom have been there for decades).

Summary of Violations observed (see slide handout for more information).

All of the information will be available on the website.

3. Next milestones

Technical Assistance

Rajiv Ramchandra, NYS-P2I -- As soon as assessments are done data will be cross-compared to make judgments about which businesses to hone-in on. There are many factors that need to be considered. Again, this is a voluntary process (just like the assessment) so people can say no. We will consider: location, data, etc.

What does experience look like from start to finish? (See slide handout) Some administrative stuff, and baseline check. Typically assessments have in-depth component, followed by feasibility study, then followed by implementation project. In this presentation we are breezing through analysis but there is a real focus on demonstrating potential option.

Toolkit

Best Practices toolkit happens concurrently with facility assessments. Resources become knowledge base that becomes the foundation for the components of the toolkit. We have started a framework. (More information on slide handout). Examples of existing resources include the EPA's Lean Manufacturing and the Environment, and ongoing initiatives such as NYSERDA's business programs, etc. Despite NYSERDA there are other resources. The toolkit will consolidate resources in one place. Companies do not always have time to track all of them.

Two businesses will be referenced as Case Studies in the toolkit.

Knowledge Dissemination and Tech Transfer: bringing facilities in the region together to discuss outcomes at two community workshops. Publish article to show others that this can be done. And promote the content of the toolkit through various networks -- stakeholders are critical in getting people interested.

4. Community outreach (see slide for itemized list of outreach activities)

Juan Camilo Osorio, NYC-EJA -- thanks for your availability for meeting with us and answering questions between mtgs. We have been able to establish an ongoing conversation from the beginning of the project with the Community Board, thanks on feedback and support from Stakeholder Engagement Group members. The information that we received at the first SEG meeting has been very fruitful. We have met with the Environmental Protection Committee and the Economic Development Committee at the Community Board, and had a follow-up meeting recently with the District Manager and the Chair of the Environmental Protection Committee to discuss strategies for additional business engagement. In addition, we met with the Director of

the Hunts Point Development Corporation, per the suggestion of the Stakeholder Engagement Group -- who offered very useful feedback, and volunteered to join the SEG.

Activities

Juan Camilo Osorio, NYC-EJA -- What's ahead: assessments are being finished. This information will inform the selection of the two companies for technical assistance -- which at the same time, will inform the types of issues and needs to identify the most relevant best management practices for the toolkit. The toolkits will be used to train businesses at two community workshops, to be scheduled during the second year of the project -- including the BMPS but also detailed case studies that will document the technical assistance projects that were described earlier.

Future Outreach

Juan Camilo Osorio, NYC-EJA -- Now, I will pass it back to Kellie and my colleague Natasha Dwyer from NYC-EJA, who will facilitate a discussion where we would like your input on how to best reach out to businesses to engage them in the facility assessments, and to recruit them for the community workshops.

5. Discussion

- Additional referrals for facility assessments
- Opportunities for business engagement
- Feedback on date/time and locations for upcoming workshops

Steve Dorn, Milea Trucks -- local businesses under discussion are some of our customers. A lot of businesses are wary of having government agencies show up at their doors. At the end of the day, what are these businesses supposed to do? Are they going to be told that they should do something that other people outside flood zone are not?

Juan Camilo Osorio, NYC-EJA -- the capital resources provide through the technical assistance is part of the incentive. Also the toolkit will provide additional opportunities to save money and to improve the operation of the business.

Natasha Dwyer, NYC-EJA -- the point here is to create an opportunity to identify potential strategies to enhance performance now, rather than the DEC coming later to issue violations.

Steve Dorn, Milea Trucks -- the businesses that I work with deal with Oil, transmission fluid etc. Other guys, it's a different deal.

Kellie Terry, THE POINT -- that type of information is being gathered, and is going to be used further down the line.

Alexa Campos -- Who does the gentleman represent? How are the businesses approached?

Steve Dorn, Milea Trucks -- My name is Steve Dorn, from Milea Trucks. Most family businesses see government and think they are going to be fined (i.e. it will cost them money).

Leonel Batista, NYS-DEC -- People don't think that the government is going to help them. The purpose of the assessment is broader than tracking individual violations. But it's in the businesses best interest to be assessed now because there are fewer stakes. In the future, there will be regulations and actions. These initial practices are just for knowledge acquisition (both on the side of the gov't and on the business).

Next Steps

Kellie Terry, THE POINT -- suggestions on locations for community workshops? The idea is that we want to open this opportunity to as many folks as possible. Are meeting the way to go? The first workshop with businesses is supposed to be in July. Based on your feedback, we will do peer to peer outreach then referrals. What about workshops? How do you think that information can be distributed?

Steve Dorn, Milea Trucks -- Do it through a summer breakfast

Angela Tovar, Sustainable South Bronx -- Barbecue, icebreaker. Has to be accessible!

Tom Outerbridge, SIMS -- Frame the workshops as a tutorial on how to avoid tickets. More immediate/tangible take away. Let them know that more scrutiny is down the road. Wording has too much jargon. You need to simplify the message.

Kellie Terry, THE POINT -- Like a holiday party, an opportunity to "hang out" socialize etc. Chamber meetings?

Natasha Dwyer, NYC-EJA -- we've taken advantage of Community Board meetings.

Juan Camilo Osorio, NYC-EJA -- what other suggestions do you have for the timing/location of the community workshops?

Angela Tovar, Sustainable South Bronx -- Another suggestion would be to have these events be co-sponsored by some of the local stakeholders at the table. This will help with the perception of the event.

Alexa Campos / Steve Dorn, Milea Trucks -- Yes, have them during warm weather, with food. Afternoon works best for produce guys.

Alexa Campos -- can help get the word out for event.