



Department of
Environmental
Conservation



NYC Industrial Waterfront Communities Pollution Prevention, Toxics Reduction, and Resiliency Planning

Meeting Minutes from Third Stakeholder Engagement Group Meeting Agenda

Date: Tuesday, October 20th, 2015
Time: 12:30-2:00pm
Location: THE POINT CDC, 940 Garrison Avenue, Bronx, NY 10474
Facilitators: Juan Camilo Osorio, NYC-EJA and Angela Tovar, THE POINT CDC

Meeting minutes from the third stakeholder engagement group meeting concerning **NYC Industrial Waterfront Pollution Prevention, Toxics Reduction, and Resiliency Planning**. The meeting was held at THE POINT CDC on Tuesday, October 20th, 2015 with participants from the New York State Department of Environmental Conservation (NYS-DEC), the New York State Pollution Prevention Institute (NYS-P2I), the New York City Environmental Justice Alliance (NYC-EJA), and members of the Stakeholder Engagement Group.

Attendees:

Leonel Batista, NYS-DEC
Kim Bawden, NYS-P2I
Alexa Campos, Community Board 2 Environmental Committee
Sarah Carlson, NYS-DEC
James Donnelly, Hunts Point Service Station
Steve Dorn, Milea Trucks
Hassan Hussein, NYS-DEC
Josephine Infante, Hunts Point Economic Development Corporation
Paul John, NYS-DEC
Lorne LaMonica, US-EPA
Venetia Lannon, NYS-DEC
Juan Camilo Osorio, NYC-EJA
Antirson R. Ortiz, Assemblyman Marcos A. Crespo
Tom Outerbridge, SIMS

Thomas V. Penzone, NYS-DEC
Catherine Prunella, NYS-DEC
Amanda Septimo, Congressman Jose Serrano
Pamela Soto, NYC-EJA
Angela Tovar, Sustainable South Bronx

Welcoming remarks

Angela Tovar, THE POINT CDC, and Juan Camilo Osorio, NYC Environmental Justice Alliance

1. Introduction:

Venetia Lannon, NYS-DEC-- This is a grant from the EPA and we are very grateful to the EPA for funding this project. This really was NYC-EJA's brain child with the Waterfront Justice Project. For a number of years NYC-EJA has been talking about the concern of waterfront industrial neighborhoods, which in NYC are significant maritime and industrial areas (SMIAs), that are also environmental justice neighborhoods, and that are all in the flood zone. So that seemed like a recipe for disaster that Sandy really drove home. We want to get an even better grip of what are the toxics that are in our neighborhoods, how can we reduce them, and how we can prevent their release in an extreme storm. We're going to focus today talking about the assessments we did, which for DEC are the heart of the project. We went out to see the facilities in your neighborhood and took a look to see how they could be made more resilient and what opportunities for pollution prevention there may be.

All Attendees introduce themselves.

2. Project overview and status update:

Report on status and preliminary findings of Facility Assessments (total businesses assessed, lessons learned)

NYS-DEC reviews goals, objectives, and tasks – see slides for more information.

Sarah Carlson, NYS-DEC— We've completed the first two tasks and now we're in the middle of task 3. We are going to present the first two tasks and where we are in task 3.

We have completed 62 facility assessments in this area, and this is a list of all the types of facilities we've assessed. — See slides for types of businesses assessed.

When we did these assessments, we gave each a risk assessment on a scale of 1 to 5 for the probability of release of a chemical and potential impact on the environment. Then we gave it an overall risk assessment of low, moderate, or high. The picture on the left shows a chemical bath at a facility, and if there were a flood at this facility this whole bath of chemicals could potentially be released to the environment. The impact on the environment depends both on

how toxic the chemical is and how much there is. The picture on the right shows drum waste storage stored directly on the ground. If there was a flood, they could potentially be tipped over. We had a lot of auto-related facilities, and before we did the assessments we were thinking that we would do the pollution prevention portion of the project at two auto related facilities. But now, through the assessments we realized that there is really a lot going on in this neighborhood and we're not fully sure that we are going to only focus on the auto sector.

Venetia Lannon, NYS-DEC—And I would say that is part of what we are looking for from you guys, is where we should be focusing.

Lorne LaMonica, US-EPA— Do you have percentages for how this is broken down by industry sector?

Kim Bawden, NYS-P2I—At least 43% of the companies are auto-related.

Question from audience—Were the assessed businesses all volunteers?

Answer— Yes.

Question from audience—When you say risk assessment, medium-high, is that purely the event of a flood? What if there is a fire that is driven by climate change or another accident?

Paul John, NYS-DEC—We were not looking at fires, just flooding impact if there is a storm.

Comment from audience—Well, I think a fire could be just as likely.

Paul John, NYS-DEC— We had set parameters, were looking from a flooding lens.

Venetia Lannon, NYS-DEC— And not just flooding, because one company during Sandy actually had their roof ripped off.

Sarah Carlson, NYS-DEC— I'm going to finish off with this map, which also shows residential and open space, and how close they are to these businesses.

Mapping and spatial analysis of facility assessments and other environmental permits

Juan Camilo, NYC-EJA— The next few slides are going to describe some supportive research that we have been developing along with the project partners to go along with the facility assessments.

For task 2, NYC-EJA has developed 16 maps to understand where the facilities are located, document the location of various environmental permits from US-EPA, NYS-DEC, NYC-DEP, and see where these permits are in relationship to our assessments so we can have a full understanding of what is out there beyond what we have the opportunity to assess, and break

down the inventory in terms of where these facilities are in terms of hurricane storm surge zones. –See slides for examples of task 2 maps

For task 4, we are doing a similar analysis to understand how to identify the potential impacts on the community. In addition to mapping open and residential space, we have also been trying to understand the transportation amenities and other infrastructure, including emergency evacuation infrastructure, to produce a comprehensive understanding of these risks that we can then use to inform the community. –See slides for examples of task 4 maps

Community outreach activities to date and future outreach goals for Community Workshops

Juan Camilo, NYC-EJA— Last time, we had discussed some of the official SEG meetings and some meetings with the community board, individual calls, and specific meetings we had with some of you to identify specific activities. We are very grateful for your time in making sure we are on the right track, and for your support as we move forward. After we are done with the two technical assistance projects that Kim is going to walk you through, we are planning two community workshops where we want to disseminate and share the findings of the project and really engage more businesses besides those two companies that we will be working with. So we want to work with you to identify the ideal date and venue for these workshops.

3. Next milestones in work plan:

On-site Technical assistance for two businesses in study area (NYSP2I)

Kim Bawden, P2I— Task 3 is to do on-site technical assistance for two businesses. After we've done technical assistance we will develop a toolkit. DEC has carried out assessments and we have looked at different aspects and criteria for how to prioritize contacting companies:

- Storm surge zone (1-high priority, 4-lower priority)
- Willingness to participate (1- interested, 4 - not willing)
- P2 opportunity identified
- Overall risk level (High, Medium, Low)

What P2I did is after we looked at the spreadsheet of assessments, we wanted to take these metrics and use it to help us prioritize connecting with these companies. We identified 4 companies that were willing to participate and we conducted site visits on 9/21 and 9/22. The objective of the site visit is to perform brief technical analysis to identify P2 implementation opportunities relevant to the objectives of the EPA grant. Oftentimes for P2I, we will go on site and help companies via our direct assistance programs. The objective of this project upfront is to identify immediate P2 implementation that we can do right off the bat. — See slides for map of the 4 companies visited.

TWI-LAQ is a manufacturer of cleaning chemicals and janitorial supplies. They currently utilize P2 strategies, such as using waste water from one process as input for the next production batch. They produce minimum hazardous waste and have a solar panel on the roof of their building. This is an indicator to us that this company is taking steps to reduce their hazardous waste and impact on their environment. The areas of opportunity identified include flooding in

basement during heavy rains due to sewer back-up and high water costs due to the amount of water used in products (not production). As a result, we did not identify any immediate P2 opportunities. TWI-LAQ is not an ideal candidate for the EPA grant but may benefit from other programs.

Baldor foods provides high quality produce to clients all over the United States, e.g. restaurants, hospitals, and hotels. Areas of opportunity are that they generate approximately 30,000 lbs of food waste/day that goes to landfill, so there is a waste opportunity there. Baldor also has experienced issues with forklift battery life due to the round-the-clock nature of their operation. To remedy this problem, Baldor is testing methanol fuel cells as a means of extending the life of these forklifts. There is opportunity to help them reduce their waste, and to look at an alternative technology to methanol fuel cells. Rochester Institute of Technology (RIT) has experience in the area of anaerobic digestion and hydrogen fuel cells, the latter potentially being a more environmentally friendly alternative to methanol fuel cells. However, this requires a lot of research and is not an immediate P2 opportunity. As a result, NYSP21 is recommending that Baldor apply to the Direct Assistance (DA) program to help them continue on their path, but Baldor is not an ideal candidate for the EPA grant.

Industrial Diamond Laboratories (IDL) reclaims spent Micron (small diamonds and artificial diamonds) from industrial processes such as a saw. Shipments of spent micron are sent to the company where they are washed with acid, cooked, dried, and strained until they resemble shining gold/green crystals. This reclaimed Micron is then sent back to the companies for re-use. Areas of opportunity include that IDL currently uses large quantities of strong acids (Sulfuric, Hydrochloric, Nitric, and some Hydrofluoric) in their reclamation process. Once used, the acids are diluted with water and washed down the drain. IDL also mentioned that they would appreciate new fans and blowers for the back of their facility, where acid has corroded and damaged fans over time. We want to do immediate P2 implementation, but we weren't aware of an alternative to diamond reclamation technology. NYSP21 performed initial research to determine if there is a commercially available alternative to the acid etching process. Our goal in this project is explicitly states to reduce hazardous materials as well as toxic risk exposure. Maybe there is a way to help them and we are still looking into it.

Amanda Septimo, Congressman Serrano— The point about the acid corroding the fans in the blowers- what is that process like?

Kim Bawden, P2I— If you have acid sitting out in the air, it can corrode your air. Again, this is a small company and they don't use large amounts of acid but what they do use are out there.

Juan Camilo, NYC-EJA— Just being there and observing what compliance looks like is really scary. What you see in these pictures are in compliance with the existing regulation. This business is unique in the sense that what they do is very unique in NYC. The way in which they approached the visit and responded to our questions was in the way of someone who wants to do the right thing. It's interesting to balance how we can have the biggest impact.

Kim Bawden, P2I— The biggest impact is kind of a relative term because here is a big impact company, but there is only one. So do we focus on one company that has pretty bad materials that they are using, or do we focus on a company where the technology implementation is very transferrable?

Moving on to the Hunts Point Service Station. Hunts Point Service Station is an auto repair and service station which disposes of large amounts of waste oil, filters, rags and solvents. Currently, the rags are thrown away, and the remaining chemicals are mixed together and shipped away as hazardous waste. The oil filters are picked up by a recycling company. Hunt's Point currently uses chlorinated solvents as part of their cleaning operation. There is an opportunity to reduce or eliminate the use of chlorinated solvents through the use of an in house parts cleaner. We are gathering information about the parts cleaner right now on costs and metrics. Back of the envelope calculations show that this parts cleaner could reduce the chlorinated the solvents up to 80% and it recycles the cleaner in house. We are looking at that as a purchase. We are also looking at alternative cleaning solvents that they can use that are non-chlorinated. The other piece of technology in question is obtaining an oil filter crusher for their facility. This machine would serve two purposes: first, oil inside the filters can be removed and recovered for off-site recycle; second, the volume and subsequent recycling costs of waste filters would be significantly reduced through compaction. We have identified them as a good candidate, so we will continue to scope this out.

Juan Camilo, NYC-EJA— For those of you who may not be familiar with the name Hunts Point Service Station, this is Mo Gridders, which had the barbecue. Unfortunately, that part of the business has closed, but this is a business that has been in the community for decades and wants to continue growing and expanding, and are interested in making the business cleaner and more resilient.

Toolkit and workshops to share best management practices to build resiliency for climate adaptation and pollution prevention

P2I reviews next steps and the best practices toolkit, see slide handout for more information.

Kim Bawden, P2I— Any questions for me while I'm up here?

Angela Tovar, THE POINT— You had mentioned while talking about Baldor that they should apply for a direct assistance grant.

Kim Bawden, P2I— As part of what P2I does, we provide technical assistance to companies in NYS. We have a number of core programs, and the direct assistance program could be a good fit for Baldor. Any company can apply and if there is an opportunity and the company qualifies, since we are funded by the DEC there is a large cost-share and often companies will have to pay based on their size, but we would provide the scope of the project and align tasks, timeline, and budget. If we don't have in-house expertise we utilize our partnerships.

Angela Tovar, THE POINT—Are there other companies initially scoped for this process that will be eligible for that as well? Would they be given that information if they are?

Kim Bawden, P2I— Absolutely. Industrial diamond, if they do not qualify for this project, we can recommend that they apply to our direct assistance program.

Hassan Hussein, NYS-DEC— Let me just say something about IDL. The operation, by nature, has to be done with open vessels, so barrels with hazardous materials are open. It is very common in New York to have acid neutralization. In fact, the New York State regulations are more stringent than the federal regulations. We ensure that companies follow environmental regulations, and are not discharging anything toxic into the sewer.

Venetia Lannon, NYS-DEC—That is helpful clarification, and I think its kind of the poster child for the types of companies we are working with. We don't have safeguards against your roof blowing off in our regulations, for example.

Kim Bawden, P2I—When we're looking at diamond reclamation, if we find a process that doesn't use these acids, that's not necessarily transferrable. But you're right, the acid neutralization process is transferrable. Good point.

Hassan Hussein, NYS-DEC — Now with climate change, regulations are trying to foresee these impacts. Need to balance many tradeoffs.

4. Discussion:

- Discuss candidates for technical assistance
- Discuss upcoming opportunities for business engagement
- Feedback on date/time and locations for upcoming workshops

Lorne LaMonica, US-EPA—What is your timeframe for conducting site visits to the 62 facilities? You have 4 now, but I thought there would be a bigger pool.

Kim Bawden, P2I— We base moving forward on whether or not we are going to have 2 successful projects from these companies. We wanted to meet with the SEG and decide on where we will focus next. We don't want to look at all 62 of them if we can identify 2 that really fit the requirements for the proposal and are willing to participate. We have prioritized them initially and contacted them, but we have not proceeded because we want to make sure as a group we are in consensus.

Juan Camilo, NYC-EJA— All 62 companies were assessed by DEC. These 4 companies are the ones that scored higher and we went back for a second round.

Lorne LaMonica, US-EPA— Did you rank the facilities?

Kim Bawden, P2I— We prioritized them in a list, not ranked 1-2-3, but we put them in groupings.

Lorne LaMonica, US-EPA— How many are in the first group?

Kim Bawden, P2I— We went through 15 so far.

Lorne LaMonica, US-EPA— So you've assessed 15 facilities in detail.

Kim Bawden, P2I— When I say 15, I mean I reached out to 15 and set up site visits with as many as we could. Some companies were not responsive after numerous attempts.

Juan Camilo NYC-EJA— Out of the 62 we identified a series of candidates that scored high on the risk assessment. Kim is highlighting that as part of this assessment we have factored in the interest of the businesses in participating when selecting them.

Steve Dorn, Milea Trucks— You mentioned Baldor. Baldor is taking initiative on fuel cells, especially with electric forklifts, and everyone is looking at that. But frankly, nobody wants to spend any money. If there's anything you can do to back them up on that, it would be the next step for Hunts Point Market. If you give Baldor something, it will help the other businesses. What's going to happen is you will set off a sequence of events where now you're going to have that technology.

Juan Camilo, NYC-EJA— One of the reasons we looked at Baldor is because this group suggested it. They are a larger company, but in the spirit of the grant we really want to prioritize businesses that don't have the resources to invest in looking into this technology. Baldor is a little ahead of the game, so they may be eligible for the Direct Assistance Program or other alternatives. I agree with you that their work is so interesting and already showing some results, but that is a little different from what we're trying to do with this technical assistance project.

Josephine Infante, Hunts Point EDC— I think the Hunts Point Gas Station is obviously a good choice. They are a model company and they will work with you. Some of these companies have been there forever but aren't willing to move forward. You have to show models. With Baldor, I think that is a great choice for the technical and direct assistance. To the person who said this is supposed to be for companies who can't- well all companies have their challenges, I don't care how big they are. Another reason I think Baldor is ideal is because its practically on the waterfront, and the implications of flooding or anything else affects the park that's right next door. I think Baldor is great because you'll have great cooperation, and the direct assistance is probably the best thing that you can get for them from the state.

Kim Bawden, P2I— I want to make it clear that we are interested in Baldor, but the work that is required is much more comprehensive and requires research, and testing, and validation. So that's why they're not ideal for this particular project.

Steve Dorn, Milea Trucks— When businesses hear EPA, DEC, they get nervous. So it took me some talking to get you to Baldor. They are probably one of the more knowledgeable, progressive groups who want to be helpful all around. And you could use them to show the other groups that you're not there to "spank" them. \$10k is more meaningful to other companies, not Baldor. We need to let them know this isn't about summonses. Baldor has meetings there all the time with different community groups, and word gets around.

Josephine Infante, Hunts Point EDC— We have to be strategic. They'll give you \$10k back if you solve a problem for them, believe me.

Amanda Septimo, Congressman Jose Serrano— In thinking about businesses and willingness to participate, and looking to expand that shortlist: I think balancing priorities on the waterfront and in the peninsula specifically, just thinking about immediate how to prevent a catastrophe if there was a hurricane tomorrow, I would probably also vote for the diamond group. But, it sounds like the goal is to really take a deep dive into companies that would allow for these practices to unfold on an industry level. One of the things that could be useful is looking at companies that are in lower storm surge zones. So just focusing on higher ranked businesses that are in a category 1 or 2. And if there are really interesting lessons that are learned there, those can be appropriated to a zone 4.

Hassan Hussein, NYS-DEC— We have a list of companies that we spoke to. Maybe we can consult the community groups, and people who know these companies, and talk to them. There's always the case where people know we're coming and people get nervous- this is not the case, we are here to help, not just for them but for the entire community.

Sarah Carlson, NYS-DEC— Natansa furniture is at the top of our list.

Kim Bawden, P2I— They were not interested, they almost hung up on me when I called them.

Lorne LaMonica, US-EPA— We talked about this last time, and if you recall you said you wanted to spend a lot of time and effort to find a way of bringing more people and businesses into this community stakeholder process. Has there been any additional thought about other ways of engaging businesses?

Juan Camilo, NYC-EJA— Yes, that is one of the reason Josephine Infante is here, she represents the Hunts Point Economic Development Corporation and the businesses there. We reached out to her and she joined the SEG after that. We also want to mention Mo Gridder's because that was a business that was suggested to us as a place that we could have meetings, but unfortunately their barbecue place closed down. We're still looking for a venue for community meetings but that hasn't happened yet.

Angela Tovar, THE POINT— Something that we need to recognize is that climate resiliency has already been adopted by both the business community and the community at large. Its something that we're working on: we have a working group, we went through the Rebuild by Design process, there is a lot of synergy right now between the business community and the

residential community here. Use that to your advantage. We're working through this working group process with the NYC EDC and there is a commitment on the city and federal level to allocate millions of dollars towards climate resiliency. It's certainly a priority for people in the community, there are a lot of people involved in this process on both ends- on the business end and the community end- as well as our elected officials and our leaders. We're lucky to have two elected officials here today that have made those commitments.

Juan Camilo, NYC-EJA— To the elected officials, can we rely on you guys to put a word out? If we go back to the businesses and we haven't received the type of enthusiasm we need, can you help us leverage some interest from those businesses?

Amanda Septimo, Congressman Jose Serrano— Yes, I actually asked and I can commit from the Congressman's office. I will get them to talk to you.

Juan Camilo, NYC-EJA— We haven't heard from everybody, and I want to make sure we do. Are there other questions or comments?

Steve Dorn, Milea Trucks— At least half of the food in the city comes through Hunts Point. In the last hurricane I lost 100 trucks just from flooding. If there isn't some sort of a plan to get the trucks out, you're not getting food, and that is one of the problems we had last time. We need a plan set up to bang companies like me over the head in advance to get the trucks out of a flood area and to high ground—its such a necessity.

Juan Camilo, NYC-EJA— You should talk to Angela and the guys at the POINT.

Steve Dorn, Milea Trucks— Yea, I know these guys.

Angela Tovar, THE POINT— I'd love to talk to you.

Juan Camilo, NYC-EJA— Anything from people who haven't spoken, Tom, Alexa?

Alexa Campos, Community Board 2 Environmental Committee— I'm just wondering, who is going to follow up after you guys get your grant and what is going to happen after this money is invested?

Juan Camilo, NYC-EJA— As part of the project, we need to document the impact of that investment in terms of reducing the waste, increasing the efficiency of the process for reducing the chemicals. The results of that investment will be documented as a part of this project as required by the EPA and the grant.

Hassan Hussein, NYS-DEC— There will also be workshops describing our results, and that should be the extent of that.

Juan Camilo, NYC-EJA— We're beginning to plan these workshops to disseminate what we find here, and we want to reach out to a large number. Mo Gridder's is no longer an option. What is a place we can host a workshop and how should we be thinking about this? Should it be during the week, a weekend? Give us some feedback.

Venetia Lannon, NYS-DEC— And we can focus it using the auto industry as an example, as they will be key. Is there a forum for the automotive world to get together, or is it disparate?

Josephine Infante, Hunts Point Economic Development Corporation— These is a restaurant called Fertelli's that is interested in building a meeting space next to their restaurant, I can tell them I have their first meeting once they build it.

Venetia Lannon, NYS-DEC— Or maybe even taking over the restaurant at a certain time.

Josephine Infante, Hunts Point Economic Development Corporation— Yes, yes.

Tom Outerbridge, SIMS— Can you release the prioritized list of the 62 businesses if you want help reaching out to them? At least the high risk ones?

Hassan Hussein, NYS-DEC— We have them categorized by high and low priorities, but we really need to prioritize them within the category. We'll have a brief discussion on how they should be prioritized and we'll focus on the ones that would be most beneficial on a wider scale, and then we'll try one more time to get the community's help in reaching them.

Venetia Lannon, NYS-DEC— So, we'll cull it for you one more time. There's some sensitivity about distributing people's names and saying they're at risk, but maybe we can sit with you one on one and call out to folks if we think they can help us reach them.

Angela Tovar, THE POINT— Was your original site assessment done over the phone?

Multiple people – No

Angela Tovar, THE POINT— So the people who are ignoring you now have already met you?

Venetia Lannon, NYS-DEC— You can say it that way.

Angela Tovar, THE POINT— That's insane, since there's some money tied to this.

Hassan Hussein, NYS-DEC— We think that they think that this is going to be time consuming for them. We need to explain to them that this isn't going to be overwhelming for them. That time-consuming assumption is one of the biggest things on their minds.

James Donnelly, Hunts Point Service Station— We are very interested and happy about this program. We've been in this community since 1958, my father has started down here. There is

a certain ignorance where people feel that when the EPA or the DEP is coming through their doors they're going to fine them. They think that having a program like this is going to cost them more money to be compliant, where in fact this program will make it less expensive to be compliant. That's basically why you're not getting feedback from these people, they're a little scared and uneducated on what's going on here. We're repair shop guys, we fix cars. We don't know anything about chemicals. If there is some kind of understanding that someone is going to come in and show us how to label products on the shelves, that's where we're focused on.

Venetia Lannon, NYS-DEC— So if we were able to come up with something that was really easy to understand- these are the chemicals you use, here are some substitutes, here are some practices to make things better for your workers, here's how you can save money in the instances of oil disposals- how do we get everyone in one room, or do we really have to go door to door?

James Donnelly, Hunts Point Service Station— I would host a group in my shop. My shop, we pride ourselves in being clean and keeping the environment clean. I would host a meeting.

Multiple people— Thank you.