

No.	Commenter's Name/Address	Received	Issued Raised	Staff Response
1	Phil Cianciotto President of Seneca Lake Pure Waters Association pcdrc@frontiernet.net & slpwa@senecalake.org	11/29/2010 Email  1/27/2011 Email	Regarding the watershed & the Lake: Stability of caverns, possibility of leaks into Lake & environment. Catastrophic failure of brine containment pond. What is the process for public input & time of hearings?  Request for him, as well as SLPWA to be on mailing list. Watershed concerns. Fails to address the unique geology of the Seneca Lake basin & potential intrusion. Underlying salt beds & current high chloride concentrations in lake, release of salt & LPG into lake. Air & water concerns. Recommends dSEIS Scoping Outline include a geological assmnt & add'l testing of salt intrusion.	
2	Justin S. Miller Harris Beach PLLC 677 Broadway Ste 1101 Albany, NY 12207 jmillier@HarrisBeach.com	1/10/2011 Email	Requesting copy of all SEQR notices & communications and copy to: J. Kelsey Jones, Executive Director @ Schuyler Co IDA, 2 N Franklin St, Watkins Glenn, NY 14891	No scope comments
3	Alice Bartholomew 415 Wall St. Elmira, NY 14905 aiw777@yahoo.com	1/12/2011 Email	Are caverns geologically suitable for storing hazardous materials? Safety precautions for brine pond? Due to truck traffic, what are risks of spills & accidents that could effect Seneca Lake Are there planned safety measures? How will increased truck traffic effect Watkins Glen? Who pays for road damage due to heavy truck traffic?	
4	Charles Roth Oak Meadow Farms Reading Center, NY oakmeadowfarms@yahoo.com	1/13/2011 Email	Wants to be kept updated on where the dSEIS stands.	No scope comments

5	Rachel Treichler 7988 Van Amburg Rd. Hammondsport, NY 14840 treichlerlaw@frontiernet.net	1/14/2011 Email	Missing description in Draft Scoping Outline of location of facility & no location of brine pond. Are there maps? What permits are applied for.	
6	Ruth Benedict 169 E Leach Rd Penn Yan, NY 14527 benedict.ruth86@gmail.com	1/16/2011 Email	Extreme concern about project. Fragile & Valuable natural Environment. Seneca Lake and the Finger Lakes Region.	
7	Cecile A Lawrence 14 Alpine Dr Appalachian, NY clawren1@binghamton.edu	1/17/2011 Email	<p>potential for catastrophic structural failure of the surface impoundment.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- potential for subsidence associated with underground storage operations.</li> <li>- potential for surface water contamination in the event of an impoundment structure failure due to its proximity to Seneca Lake.</li> <li>- potential for ground water contamination in the event of impoundment structure leakage, subsidence, or loss of cavern integrity.</li> <li>- amount of additional road and rail traffic.</li> <li>- potential truck traffic impacts to SR 14 &amp; 14A.</li> <li>- additional train traffic over Watkins Glen Gorge bridge.</li> <li>- operation of a new rail and truck loading facility in a sparsely developed rural area. where none currently exist. People are running out of places from which to escape the stress of the cacophony, toxic diesel fumes, dust, vibrations, industrialization. This is causing numerous synergistic deleterious impacts on the health of humans and all life.</li> <li>- visual and cumulative environmental impact of a new rail and truck loading facility, brine pond.</li> <li>- visual impact, noise, lights, vibrations (vibroacoustic disease) compressor building. Many animals communicate via sound and vibration. By facilitating the construction of equipment that can cause VBD, we are creating harm to the environment.</li> </ul>	
8	Peter Gamba Branchport, NY pgamba1007@aol.com	1/18/2011 Email	Threat to the environment and the finger lakes, wine & ag business and the livability in the community. Against the project.	

9	Michale Swasta 411 Watkins Rd Horseheads, NY 14845 mswasta@stny.rr.com	1/18/2011 Email	Catastrophic failure of salt caverns. Traffic & railway impacts. Roadway concerns. Stormwater retention ponds? Brine pond & its failure & over-flowing. Pipeline.	
10	Jack & Judith Wilbert 672 Crystal Valley Rd Dundee, NY 14837 jwwilbert@frontiernet.net	1/18/2011 Email	no scope comments. Hydrofracking concerns.	
11	Cheryl Schafer 3514 Kelly's Corner Rd. Interlaken, NY 14847 yarn@schaeferyarn.com	1/18/2011 email	Against Project, no specific concerns.	
12	Vinny Aliperit Atwarer Estate Vineyards Hector, NY 14841 vinny@atwatervineyards.com	1/19/2011 email	Against Project & hydrofracking. Feels risky, no specific concerns.	
13	Mike Harter mtharter@gmail.com	1/20/2011 Email	Catastrophic events to ecosystems & health. Contamination. Seepage in Seneca Lake. Hydrofracking concerns.	
14	Bill Tague billtague@empacc.net	1/20/2011	What are environment concerns both pos & neg. Traffic. Job Creation?	
15	Eric Aceto eric@ithacastring.com	1/20/2011 Email	no scope comments. Hydrofracking concerns.	
16	Jess Youngquest finsterco@gmail.com	1/19/2011 Email	no scope comments. Hydrofracking concerns.	
17	Greg Grodem rjgreg@lightlink.com	1/19/2011 Email	no scope comments. Hydrofracking concerns.	

18	Elizabeth Chiron 3355 Co Rte 28-Irleandville Rd Watkins Glen, NY 14891 bethchiron@gmail.com	1/20/2011 Email	Permanent contamination of drinking water. Traffic - Train & Truck. Brine pond & illegal dumping into the lake. Threat to tourist trade & wine trail.	
19	Carolyn Bayer-Broring Blue Crab Racing carolyn.bayerbroring@dhs.gov	1/21/2011 Email	What about accidents at caverns & brine pond? Truck Traffic	
20	Jennifer Wofford 54 Cayuga St. Trumansburg, Ny 14886 woffordj@gmail.com	1/21/2011 Email	no scope comments. Hydrofracking concerns.	
21	Kathy Pettet and Rooster Fish 301 N Franklin St Watkins Glen, NY 14891 roosterfishbooking@gmail.com	1/21/2011 Email	hydrofracking/butane storage - against. No specific scope comments.	
22	Robert E Davis davis4470@roadrunner.com	1/21/2011 Email  Add'l email 1/25/11	Catastrophic events. Impacts on land & water Impacts on drinking water.  Concern that the review of existing salt cavern storage facilities and safety of operation is not in the scoping outline.	
23	Steve Coffman Member of Committee to Preserve the Finger Lakes	1/21/2011 Email attached to Jill Lewis' 1/23/2011 email	Spills & explosions. Seneca Lake contamination. Well being of ag, wineries, growing agri-tourism, esthetic qualities, retirement appeal & Mennonites.	
23	Jill Lewis lewis22908@gmail.com	1/23/2011 Email	Pollution risk.	

24	<p>Jeffrey Dembowski 335 State St Albany, NY 12210 jcdembowski@gmail.com</p>	<p>1/22/2011 Email</p> <p>1/3/2011 Email</p>	<p>Surface and ground water contamination . Noise &amp; light air pollution. Potential surface &amp; subterranean explosions. Aesthetic intrusions. Negative impacts on the wine &amp; tourism industry. Truck &amp; railway traffic - derailling trains &amp; explosions.</p> <p>Concerned with Railroad Quality of life.</p>	
25	<p>Mark Venuti, Esq. Heaton &amp; Venuti, LLP 118 Main St. Penn Yan, NY 14527 mark@heatonandvenuti.com</p>	<p>1/23/2011 Email</p>	<p>Seneca Lake and other water supplies, land. Trucking dangers. Environmental risks.</p>	
26	<p>Rob Thomas Shalestone Vineyards 9681 Rte 414 Lodi, NY info@shalestonevineyards.com</p>	<p>1/23/2011 Email</p>	<p>Safety of project. Truck Traffic.</p>	
27	<p>Anne &amp; John Quashnoc 11741 E Bluff Dr. Keuka Park, NY 14478 sr12208185@juno.com</p>	<p>1/23/2011 Email</p>	<p>Trucks. Noise. Pollution. Toxic waste of the gas industry.</p>	
28	<p>Jannica Moskal jannica@summittostream.com</p>	<p>1/24/2011</p>	<p>Property values. Water supply being hampered or contaminated.</p>	
29	<p>Jeanne Fudala 1697 School Street Alpine, NY 14805 senecajeane@aol.com</p>	<p>1/25/2011 Email</p>	<p>Severe catastrophic events. Water pollution. Seneca Lake. Brine pond concerns.</p>	

30	Joseph Campbell muchado2@gmail.com	1/27/2011 Email	Seneca Lake. Brine pond. Truck & railroad traffic. Noise. Diesel fumes.	
31	Elizabeth Hoover thepennslyvaniayankee@gmail.com	1/27/2011 Email	Seneca Lake drinking water & ecosystem. Environmental contamination. Leakage of petroleum into rock, soil, water & air. Spills during transit. Liner of holding pond. Truck traffic. Wine & ag business.	
32	Peter & Pat ladley	1/28/2011 Email	Danger of infiltration into drinking water via Seneca Lake. Industrialization of pristine environmental habitat. Truck and other traffic.	
33	Elaine Mansfield 4464 Picnic Area Rd. Burdett, NY 14818 elaine@lightlink.com	1/29/2011 Email	Seneca Lake - surface contamination from the brine-holding tank & from underground water contamination due to leakage or loss of cavern integrity. Ground & water pollution effect on ag & wine industry. Truck traffic & railroad traffic Noise. Brine pond.	
34	Harriet Eisman 1491 Caywood Rd. Lodi, NY 14860 hcl26@logical.net	1/29/2011 Email	Seneca Lake - surface contamination from the brine-holding tank & from underground water contamination due to leakage or loss of cavern integrity. Ground & water pollution effect on ag & wine industry. Truck traffic & railroad traffic Noise. Brine pond.	
35	Carolsue McCue herbcottage@hotmail.com	1/29/2011 Email	Tourism. Explosions or leakage.	

36	Yvonne Taylor speechatgjr.yahoo.com	1/29/2011 Email	<p>Land &amp; water impacts.  Traffic - rail &amp; truck.  Noise.  Visual Impacts.  Seneca Lake - Drinking water &amp; ecosystem.  Spills.  Risk of Radioactive materials contaminating workers, water, wildlife or the public.  Brine pond concerns.  Contamination of brine water w/ LPG byproducts.  Explosions &amp; ability of fire department to handle.  Stability of cavern?  Tourism &amp; grape growers.</p>	
37	Ellen & Oskar Schmidt 8 Genung Circle. Ithaca, NY 14850 oner_schmidt@juno.com	1/29/2011 Email	<p>Seneca Lake - surface contamination from the brine-holding tank &amp; from  underground water contamination due to leakage or loss of cavern integrity.  Ground &amp; water pollution effect on ag &amp; wine industry.  Truck traffic &amp; railroad traffic  Noise.  Brine pond.</p>	

38	<p>Gita Devi, owner The Ginger Cat Bed &amp; Breakfast &amp; Devi Designs gdevi@lightlink.com</p>	<p>1/29/2011 Email</p>	<p>Seneca Lake - chemicals leaching into lake. Explosions. Livelihood of tourism, wineries, boating, beauty. Polluting of land &amp; water. Visual Impacts. Truck traffic &amp; addition of VOC to ground level (grapes effected) Noise of compressor. Fissures &amp; faults that exist. Spills. Fires &amp; explosions &amp; fire department training. Surface waters &amp; aquifers. Will they discharge into lake? Brine pond failure. Radioactive materials.</p>	
39	<p>Suzanne Motheral 766 Elm St Ext Ithaca, NY 14850 coopbiz1@yahoo.com</p>	<p>1/29/2011 Email</p>	<p>Seneca Lake - surface contamination from the brine-holding tank &amp; from underground water contamination due to leakage or loss of cavern integrity. Ground &amp; water pollution effect on ag &amp; wine industry. Truck traffic &amp; railroad traffic Noise. Brine pond.</p>	
40	<p>Amanda David 1385 Beardsley Hollow Rd. Alpine, NY 14805 A.David@localnet.com</p>	<p>1/29/2011 Email</p>	<p>Seneca Lake - surface contamination from the brine-holding tank &amp; from underground water contamination due to leakage or loss of cavern integrity. Ground &amp; water pollution effect on ag &amp; wine industry. Truck traffic &amp; railroad traffic Noise. Brine pond.</p>	



41	Lenore Olmstead 1667 Taughannock Blvd. Trumansburg, NY 14886 lenorie@lightlink.com	1/29/2011 Email	Seneca Lake - surface contamination from the brine-holding tank & from underground water contamination due to leakage or loss of cavern integrity. Ground & water pollution effect on ag & wine industry. Truck traffic & railroad traffic Noise. Brine pond.	
42	Sandra Bartone Watkins Glen, NY zeedith@yahoo.com	1/30/2011 Email	No comments - against project.	
43	Barbara Cook bcook1638@yahoo.com	1/30/2011 Email	Tourism.	
44	Bertrand Salmirs 3623 Co Rte 2 PO Box 166 Hector, NY 14841-0166 bsalmirs@htva.net	1/30/2011 Email	Seneca Lake - surface contamination from the brine-holding tank & from underground water contamination due to leakage or loss of cavern integrity. Ground & water pollution effect on ag & wine industry. Truck traffic & railroad traffic Noise. Brine pond.	
45	Jim Borra St Rte 414 Hector, NY 14841 Borrowtknsgin@aol.com	1/30/2011 Email	No comments	
46	Debra Howe 5336 St Rte 228 Trumansburg, NY 14886 howedebby@gmail.com	1/30/2011 Email	Seneca Lake - surface contamination from the brine-holding tank & from underground water contamination due to leakage or loss of cavern integrity. Ground & water pollution effect on ag & wine industry. Truck traffic & railroad traffic Noise. Brine pond.	
47	Lester M. Andrew 121 N. Glenora Rd. Dundee, NY 14837 lesmaoptions@yahoo.com	1/30/2011 Email	Seneca Lake Wants to be kept advised.	

48	Maura Stephens PO Box 403 Spencer, NY 14883 mstephens@ithaca.edu	1/30/2011 Email	Truck and Railway traffic. Tourism. Noise (from compressor). Geology - fissures & faults. Spills on the watershed. Catastrophic errors due to human or equipment failure, how handled? Fire departments, hazmat. Who insures this facility? Seneca Lake, surface water, aquifers Brine pit failure. Radioactive materials.	
49	Susan Hunter Herbert 6254 Beard St. Hector, NY 14841 shh4@cornell.edu	1/30/2011 Email	Seneca Lake - surface contamination from the brine-holding tank & from underground water contamination due to leakage or loss of cavern integrity. Ground & water pollution effect on ag & wine industry. Truck traffic & railroad traffic Noise. Brine pond.	
50	Chris Cook ccharc@stny.rr.com	1/30/2011 Email	Against project - no scope comments	
51	Melissa Chipman Hector, NY 14841 lyteplyr@aol.com	1/30/2011 Email	Accidents - gas explosions Traffic & road damage.	
52	John Herbert 6254 Beard St. Valois, NY 14841 Johnberbert@htva.net	1/30/2011 Email	Seneca Lake - surface contamination from the brine-holding tank & from underground water contamination due to leakage or loss of cavern integrity. Ground & water pollution effect on ag & wine industry. Truck traffic & railroad traffic Noise. Brine pond.	

53	Sara Hess 124 Westfield Dr. Ithaca, NY 14850	1/30/2011 Email	Add to "requirements": Spills, Accidents during transport, containment of gas in caverns. Gas released into air from brine? Greenhouse gas effects. Brine pond location. Traffic. Economic effects - tourism & wineries. Visual & noise of compressor.	
54	Bill Hecht PO Box 86 Union Springs, NY 13160 wsh6@cornell.edu	1/30/2011 Email	Potential EPA involvement. Cavern stability. Geophysical information	
55	Grady & Kristina Commings kcummings95@yahoo.com	1/30/2011 Email	Brine pond. Truck & railway traffic. Obstructing views of Seneca Lake Lake contamination. Wildlife. Noise. (Reservoir Suitability Report) Air pollution. Tourism. Brine pond safety. Property values.	
56	Nan Crystal Arens Dept of Geoscience Hobart & Willam Smith Colleges Geneva, NY 14456 arens@hws.edu	1/30/2011 Email	Seneca Lake - current brine leakage into lake Paleozoic faults & catastrophic failure.	
57	Waldo Babcock 7284 Waldo Rd. Prattsburgh, NY 14873 wbabcock@empacc.net	1/30/11 Email	Brine Pond. Explosive materials Truck traffic. Negative impacts on environment & tourism & wine production. Spills or leakage into Lake	

58	Margaret Fry Keating 3970 Co Rd 2 Hector, NY 14841 pegfrykeating@hotmail.com	1/30/2011 Email	Seneca Lake - surface contamination from the brine-holding tank & from underground water contamination due to leakage or loss of cavern integrity. Ground & water pollution effect on ag & wine industry. Truck traffic & railroad traffic Noise. Brine pond.	
59	John Keating 3970 Co Rd 2 Hector, NY 14841 Johnkeating9@hotmail.com	1/30/2011 Email	Seneca Lake - surface contamination from the brine-holding tank & from underground water contamination due to leakage or loss of cavern integrity. Ground & water pollution effect on ag & wine industry. Truck traffic & railroad traffic Noise. Brine pond.	
60	Doug Couchon Elmira, NY dcouchon@gmail.com	1/30/2011 Email	Seneca Lake ecosystem. Brine pond. Explosions. Accidents & spills. Radioactive materials. Evaporation of toxic materials. Fractures & fissures. Gas product migrations. State & local authorities ability to handle emergencies. Ground level ozone. Truck traffic. Tourism& grape industry	
61	Richard & Elizabeth Adams PO Box 33 Hector, NY 14841 radams414@htva.net	1/30/2011 Email	Seneca Lake Catastrophic failure. Brine Pond. Truck & railway traffic increase. Tourism & wineries. Noise.	

62	Cameron Murdock 1385 Beardsley Hollow Rd. Alpine, NY 14805 camrock79@gmail.com	1/30/2011 Email	Seneca Lake - surface contamination from the brine-holding tank & from underground water contamination due to leakage or loss of cavern integrity. Ground & water pollution effect on ag & wine industry. Truck traffic & railroad traffic Noise. Brine pond.	
63	Terry Stewart tstewart2@stny.rr.com	1/31/2011 Email	Seneca Lake	
64	Michael J. Oates 100 Magee St. Watkins Glen, NY 14891 oatcakes1948@live.com	1/31/2011 Email	Impacts on land, water & transportation. Noise. Integrity of the underground storage caverns. Public Safety. Disasters.	
65	Taylor Peck 6315 State Rd. Alpine, NY 14805 lory@htva.net	1/31/2011 Email	Geology of salt caverns. Impacts on public safety. Brine pond. Air pollution. Brine discharge into Seneca lake Seneca lake. NORM levels. Tourism & wineries.	
66	Sarah Eckel Citizens Campaign for the Environment seckel@citizenscampaign.org	1/31/2011 Email & Letter	Sent "Examples of Accidents from Gas Storage in Salt Caverns". Cavern stability & safety. Brine pond operation & stability. Surface & groundwater subsidence of caverns.	

67	Lynn Thirion Senior Process Technician Primet Precision Materials, Inc. 950 Danby Rd., Ste 204 Ithaca, NY 14850 lthirion@primetprecision.com	1/31/2011 Email	Brine pond. Truck & railway traffic. DEC to share "reservoir Suitability Report? Seneca lake drinking water. Air & land pollution. Noise. Road repair & maintenance. Tourism, wineries. Compressor noise. Geology. Safety & security. Spills into the lake? Cost to community in event of explosion, fire, spill. Radioactive Materials.	
68	Anna Stratton 4516 McIntyre Rd. Trumansburg, NY 14886 mecklenburg.angel@gmail.com	1/31/2011 Email	Brine pond flooding. Seneca Lake - surface contamination from the brine-holding tank & from underground water contamination due to leakage or loss of cavern integrity. Ground & water pollution effect on ag & wine industry. Truck traffic & railroad traffic Noise.	
69	Jean Spooner 2401 Trinity Farms Rd Raleigh, NC 27607 jean_sponner@ncsu.edu	1/31/2011 Email	Brine pond failure. Seneca Lake surface water & drinking. Pumping, piping & transportation failure. Stormwater control failure. Impacts on ground water & aquifers. Reclamation plan.	
70	Daniel C. Hill Cayuga nation Environmental Tech Haudenausanee Environmental task Force dhill@heft.org	1/31/2011 Email	Monitoring & safety of project regarding watersheds & surface water. Drinking water contamination. "Brine" meaning.	
71	Donald Webster dgwebster48@yahoo.com	1/31/2011 Email	No scope comments, concerned DEC does a good job.	

72	Carolyn Eberhard 2434 Coddington Rd. Brooktondale, NY 14817	1/31/2011 Email	Public health Wildlife. Impact to tourism. Rail transportation. Economic analysis. Relationship to Marcellus Shale. Brine pond construction operation. Visual impacts. Safety.	
73	Jeremy Alderson radio@lightlink.com	1/31/2011 Email	Against project - no comments	
74	Phyllisa DeSarno Economic Development Office City of Ithaca 108 E. Green St. Ithaca, NY 14850 pdesarno@cityofithaca.org	1/31/2011 Email	Truck Traffic. Tourism impacts.	
75	Kate Bartholomew KBARTHOL@wgcs.org	1/31/2011 Email & letter	Brine pond & the slope. Caverns - geological assessment. Surface water. Truck traffic & railway transport. Ecological Resources -	

76	Laurie Roe Enfield, NY roelaur@gmail.com	1/31/2011 Email	Economic health - tourism, ag & wineries. Truck & railway traffic. Air & noise pollution from trucks. Brine pond location & dam permit. Evacuation plan if disaster occurs? Radioactivity. Trestle bridge in Watkins Glen Geology of salt caverns.	
77	Abiah David abiah2000@gmail.com	1/31/2011 Email	Pollution of Lake.	
78	Ashley Miller ashleym@ftg.net	1/31/2011 Email	Safety & stability of brine pond. Salt caverns & migrating during storage. Economic implications of truck traffic. Tourism & wineries.	
79	Charlotte Dickens 4612 Kellogg Rd. Burdett, NY 14818 cdickens@lightlink.com	1/31/2011 Email	Environmental & economic well-being. Public danger & pollution. Tourism impacts.	
80	Natalia J Demong njd7@cornell.edu	1/31/2011 Email	Brine Pond overflowing, liner concerns. Tourism & wineries & Ag. Watkins Glen State Park Wildlife. Radioactivity of brine. Spill pollution prevention plan. Alternate sites?	
81	Ellen Fitzhugh fingerlakesone@yahoo.com	1/31/2011 Email	no comments - concerned about storage & transportation of LPG	



82	Nancy YoungGeorge waterglass8@gmail.com	E1/31/2011 Email	Seneca Lake & location of project. "Brine" consistency. Geological concerns - faults & cracks. Truck traffic Environmental impacts.	
83	Marjorie J. Hunt 46 Main St. Dundee, NY 14838	Letter rv'd 1/31/2011	Brine storage location & leakage. Tourism. Road repair costs.	
84	Roland Penta, President Phelps Sungas, Inc. 24 Cross Rd. Geneva, NY 14456	Letter rv'd 1/31/2011	In support of project.	
85	W.M Newall 4610 Rte 14 Rock Stream, NY 14878	Letter rv'd 1/31/2011	Erosion of slope where brine pond is located & collapse. Geological faults. Transportation effect on Watkins Glen. Visual impacts.	
86	Richard Bresica NYALL, LLC 321 Loudon Rd. Loudonville, NY 12211 Brescia@nyall.com	2/1/2011 Late Email & letter	For the project.	
87	Michael Taylor Combined Energy Services 216 E. Broadway Monticello, NY 12701	2/1/2011 Late Letter	For the project.	
88	Samuel Maggio Millport, NY sam@icm.cc	2/1/2011 Late Email	Brine Pond, diesel exhaust, tourism.	

89	Dr Hillary Lambert P.O. Box 348 Aurora, NY 13026 hillary_lambert@yahoo.com	2/2/2011 Late Email	Letter from Cayuga Lake Watershed Network. Brine pond construction, stability, catastrophic failure, salt intrusion into Seneca Lk, cultural/historic resources, widen review to include federal agencies	
90	Michael Swasta 411 Watkins Road Horseheads, NY 14845 mswasta@stny.rr.com	2/3/2011 Late Email	air quality impacts, visual & noise, truck traffic, catastrophic cavern failure, public safety, water quality, brine pond	
91	Virginia Alexander 3325 Rt 329 Watkins Glen, NY 14891 vacarousel@aol.com	2/3/2011 Late Email	Railroad bridge, safety of LPG transport.	